

Social Security Appeal Board

Forty-third Annual Report

2020/2021

(1 April 2020 - 31 March 2021)

CONTENTS

	Paragraph
I. INTRODUCTION	1 - 4
II. THE BOARD	
Terms of Reference	5
Membership	6
Board Meetings	7 - 8
III. WORK OF THE BOARD	
Handling of Complaints and Enquiries	9 - 13
Number of Appeals	14 - 20
Appeals involving Medical Decisions	21 - 23
Place for Lodging Appeals	24 - 25
Handling of Appeals	26 - 28
Result of Appeals	29 - 30
Time Frame for Handling of Appeals	31
Post-appeal Follow-up	32
Publicity	33 - 34
IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	35

APPENDICES

- | | | |
|----------|---|---|
| APPENDIX | 1 | Functions of the Board and Appeal Procedures |
| APPENDIX | 2 | Analysis of Complaints Received |
| APPENDIX | 3 | Analysis of Appeals Received |
| APPENDIX | 4 | Breakdown of Comprehensive Social Security Assistance Appeals Received by Nature of Case |
| APPENDIX | 5 | Breakdown of Social Security Allowance Appeals Received by Nature of Case or Disability Claimed |

I. INTRODUCTION

The Social Security Appeal Board (the Board) was set up on 15 April 1978 as an independent body to provide a means of redress for any person not satisfied with the decision of the Social Welfare Department in respect of eligibility and payment of social security benefits.

2. The Chairman and Members of the Board are all non-officials appointed by the Chief Executive of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region. The Government provides the Board with office premises and a team of staff from the Social Welfare Department offering secretarial services to the Board and maintaining its records. The head of the team is appointed as Secretary to the Board.

3. The Board deals with appeals lodged by persons applying for, or in receipt of, Comprehensive Social Security Assistance, Social Security Allowance or Traffic Accident Victims Assistance, against the decisions of the Social Welfare Department. Detailed functions of the Board and the appeal procedures are outlined in Appendix 1.

4. This report describes the work of the Board during the year ending 31 March 2021.

II. THE BOARD

Terms of Reference

5. The terms of reference of the Board are : -
- (i) to consider individual appeals against the decisions of the Social Welfare Department on eligibility and payment of social security benefits; and
 - (ii) to publish an annual report on the work of the Board.

Membership

6. The Board consists of the Chairman and six members. Its membership as at 31 March 2021 was -

Chairman	:	Mr CHAN Chi-wing	(陳志榮先生)
Member	:	Mr HUNG Lin-cham, MH	(洪連杉先生, MH)
		Ms LAM Hiu-lam	(林曉嵐女士)
		Dr LAM Ho-yi, JP	(林顥伊博士, JP)
		Mr NGAN Man-yu	(顏汶羽先生)
		Dr TAM Kui-fu, Stanley	(譚鉅富醫生)
		Ms WONG Ching-chi, Gigi	(王政芝女士)

Board Meetings

7. Board meetings are held to consider appeals lodged by the appellants. These meetings are normally attended by the Chairman and two members. Members of the Board therefore work on a roster system.

8. The main duties of the members sitting at a Board meeting are to hear the representations of the appellants, to consider explanations given by the Social Welfare Department, to analyse cases and, finally, to make decisions on the appeals. Where the three members are unable to reach a consensus on an appeal, the decision of the majority will be followed.

III. WORK OF THE BOARD

Handling of Complaints and Enquiries

9. One of the significant roles of the Board is to handle complaints about social security benefits. These complaints may not necessarily become appeals if they can be satisfactorily resolved after explanations given by the staff of the Board or through an individual case review by the Social Welfare Department.

10. When a complaint is received, the Secretary to the Board or his staff will immediately contact the relevant Social Security Field Unit or the Traffic Accident Victims Assistance Section (i.e. the relevant office) to initiate action. The supervisor of the office will then give explanations to clarify the situation or review the case as appropriate. If the complainant is satisfied and does not wish to pursue the complaint further, the case will be considered as settled. Otherwise, he will be assisted to lodge a formal appeal.

11. Complaints, which fall outside the scope of the Board, will be referred to the relevant offices of the Social Welfare Department or other government departments for appropriate action. All complaints are reported to the Chairman and Members of the Board for their information.

12. During the year, 61 complaints were received, of which 24 (39%) were settled by the staff of the Board, 34 (56%) were referred to the relevant offices for appropriate action and three (5%) eventually became appeals. An analysis of the complaints handled in the past three years is shown in the following table:

Complaints lodged at the Board Office

Type and nature of complaints	(A) Total no. of complaints			(B) Of (A), no. of complaints settled by the Board			(C) Of (A), no. of complaints referred to relevant offices			(D) Of (A), no. of complaints leading to appeals		
	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21
Type of Complaints												
Comprehensive Social Security Assistance	44 (40%)	56 (60%)	34 (56%)	4 (9%)	8 (14%)	10 (29%)	37 (84%)	47 (84%)	23 (68%)	3 (7%)	1 (2%)	1 (3%)
Social Security Allowance	63 (58%)	38 (40%)	27 (44%)	11 (17%)	5 (13%)	14 (52%)	49 (78%)	23 (61%)	11 (41%)	3 (5%)	10 (26%)	2 (7%)
Traffic Accident Victims Assistance	2 (2%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	2 (100%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
TOTAL	109 (100%)	94 (100%)	61 (100%)	15 (14%)	13 (14%)	24 (39%)	88 (81%)	70 (74%)	34 (56%)	6 (5%)	11 (12%)	3 (5%)
Nature of Complaints												
Refusal of any payment	44 (41%)	29 (31%)	25 (41%)	4 (9%)	5 (17%)	9 (36%)	37 (84%)	16 (55%)	14 (56%)	3 (7%)	8 (28%)	2 (8%)
Amount of payment offered	45 (41%)	27 (29%)	22 (36%)	8 (18%)	3 (11%)	11 (50%)	34 (75%)	21 (78%)	11 (50%)	3 (7%)	3 (11%)	0 (0%)
Date from which payment was offered	9 (8%)	5 (5%)	1 (2%)	2 (22%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	7 (78%)	5 (100%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	1 (100%)
Issue of payment to a person other than the applicant	0 (0%)	2 (2%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	2 (100%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Delay of payment	1 (1%)	3 (3%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	1 (33%)	0 (0%)	1 (100%)	2 (67%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Others	10 (9%)	28 (30%)	13 (21%)	1 (10%)	4 (14%)	4 (31%)	9 (90%)	24 (86%)	9 (69%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
TOTAL	109 (100%)	94 (100%)	61 (100%)	15 (14%)	13 (14%)	24 (39%)	88 (81%)	70 (74%)	34 (56%)	6 (5%)	11 (12%)	3 (5%)

13. Apart from complaints, the Board received a large number of enquiries about social security benefits and other welfare services administered by the Social Welfare Department. These enquiries were, as far as possible, answered by the staff of the Board or referred to the relevant offices for appropriate action.

Number of Appeals

14. During the year, the Board received a total of 263 appeals (including 260 direct appeals and three converted from complaints), representing a decrease of 141 appeals or 35% as compared with the preceding year.

15. These 263 appeals included 45 Comprehensive Social Security Assistance cases, 217 Social Security Allowance cases and one Traffic Accident Victims Assistance case. A 3-year comparison is as follows -

Type of cases	Appeals					
	2018/19		2019/20		2020/21	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Comprehensive Social Security Assistance	59	14	58	14	45	17
Social Security Allowance	366	86	344	85	217	82
Traffic Accident Victims Assistance	0	0	2	1	1	1
TOTAL	425	100	404	100	263	100

16. As compared with the previous year, there was a decrease of 13 appeals (22%) in Comprehensive Social Security Assistance cases, a decrease of 127 appeals (37%) in Social Security Allowance cases and a decrease of one appeal in Traffic Accident Victims Assistance case.

17. Of the 217 Social Security Allowance appeals, 195 were related to Normal Disability Allowance, 16 to Higher Disability Allowance, four to Old Age Allowance and two to Old Age Living Allowance.

18. Among the 211 Disability Allowance appeals, 195 were lodged against the refusal of payment on medical grounds (i.e. ineligibility for the allowance as certified by the medical authorities concerned) and 16 against the amount of payment on medical grounds (i.e. ineligibility for disability allowance at a higher rate).

19. For the four Old Age Allowance appeals, they were lodged against the date from which payment was offered.

20. For the two Old Age Living Allowance appeals, one case was lodged against the date from which payment was offered, the other case was lodged against the reduction of payment due to the definition of a yearly period for counting the number of days of residence in Hong Kong.

Appeals involving Medical Decisions

21. Where an appeal concerning a medical assessment done by a doctor of a public hospital/clinic is made, the Board will arrange with the Hospital Authority for the applicant/recipient to undergo a medical re-assessment to be processed by the Medical Assessment Board for social security appeals. This Medical Assessment Board is an independent board with members comprising doctors from both the public and private sectors, who work for the board on a roster basis.

22. A number of public doctors and 11 private doctors, namely, Dr CHEUNG Hung-kin, Dr CHOI Sum-hung, Dr CHOO Kwong-yin, Dr IP Wing-yuk, Josephine, Dr LAI Jak-yiu, Professor LAI Shiu-ming, Jimmy, Dr LAU Lai-lin, Lilian, Dr PAK Wai, Martin, Dr PONG Chiu-fai, Jeffrey, Dr TSE Yun-tin, Paul and Dr WONG Pit-see assisted in assessing medical appeal cases referred to the Medical Assessment Board for assessment in the year.

23. During the year, a total of 149 cases (comprising 15 Comprehensive Social Security Assistance cases, 115 Normal Disability Allowance cases and 19 Higher Disability Allowance cases) were decided by the Board on the basis of the decision of the Medical Assessment Board.

Place for Lodging Appeals

24. An appellant can lodge an appeal at any one of the following offices -

- (i) the Office of the Board;
- (ii) the Headquarters of the Social Welfare Department;
- (iii) the Traffic Accident Victims Assistance Section; or
- (iv) any of the 41 social security field units.

25. A statistical breakdown in terms of place of lodging appeals is shown below –

Place of lodging appeals	Appeals					
	2018/19		2019/20		2020/21	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Office of the Board	88	21	98	24	74	28
Social Security Field Units	337	79	304	75	189	72
Traffic Accident Victims Assistance Section	0	0	2	1	0	0
TOTAL	425	100	404	100	263	100

(Note : No appeal was lodged at the Headquarters of the Social Welfare Department in the year.)

Handling of Appeals

26. Of the 263 appeals received in the year, 23 were decided, 23 withdrawn by the appellants and 217 carried forward to the year 2021/22 pending medical assessment and decision of the Board. The following table shows the overall position -

Type of cases	Number of Appeals			
	Received in 2020/21	Decided in 2020/21	Withdrawn in 2020/21	Carried forward to 2021/22
Comprehensive Social Security Assistance	45	8	1	36*
Social Security Allowance	217	15	22	180**
Traffic Accident Victims Assistance	1	0	0	1
TOTAL	263	23	23	217

* comprising 27 cases pending medical assessment and nine cases pending decision of the Board

** comprising 144 cases pending medical assessment, 35 cases pending decision of the Board and one case pending Board hearing

27. During the year, the Board decided a total of 159 cases including 23 out of the 263 appeals received within the year 2020/21 and 136 brought forward from the previous year 2019/20. No Board decision was required for 39 cases brought forward from the previous year 2019/20 due to the appellants' withdrawal of the appeals. In terms of the type of cases with Board decision made over the year, there were a total of 20 Comprehensive Social Security Assistance cases and 139 Social Security Allowance cases. A 3-year comparison is shown below -

Type of cases	Appeals decided					
	2018/19		2019/20		2020/21	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Comprehensive Social Security Assistance	49	16	46	14	20	13
Social Security Allowance	259	84	271	85	139	87
Traffic Accident Victims Assistance	0	0	2	1	0	0
TOTAL	308	100	319	100	159	100

28. Among the 159 cases decided, 149 were appeals involving the result of a medical assessment and 10 were non-medical appeals. All the 149 medical appeals were decided by the Board on the basis of the decision of the Medical Assessment Board. In respect of the 10 non-medical appeals, hearings were conducted at the Office of the Board. The appellants were notified of the hearings beforehand. Six appellants attended the hearings in person and the remaining four were absent from the hearing.

Result of Appeals

29. Of the 159 appeals decided during the year, the Board confirmed the decisions of the Social Welfare Department in 88 cases (55%) and varied its decisions in 71 cases (45%). All the 71 cases involved appeals against medical decisions (including 57 Normal Disability Allowance cases, seven Higher Disability Allowance cases and seven Comprehensive Social Security Assistance cases) and decisions of the Board were made in favour of the appellants. A breakdown of cases by nature and by type is given below

Type of Appeals Nature of Appeals	Number of cases where SWD's decisions were confirmed				Number of cases where SWD's decisions were changed			
	Compre-hensive Social Security Assistance	Social Security Allowance	Traffic Accident Victims Assistance	Total	Compre-hensive Social Security Assistance	Social Security Allowance	Traffic Accident Victims Assistance	Total
Refusal of payment	0	59	0	59	0	57	0	57
Amount of payment offered	13	13	0	26	7	7	0	14
Date from which payment was offered	0	3	0	3	0	0	0	0
Issue of payment to a person other than the applicant	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
TOTAL	13	75	0	88	7	64	0	71

30. A comparison of the relevant figures over the past three years is as follows -

Type of cases	Number of cases where SWD's decisions were confirmed			Number of cases where SWD's decisions were changed		
	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21
Comprehensive Social Security Assistance	23	20	13	26	26	7
Social Security Allowance	183	191	75	76	80	64
Traffic Accident Victims Assistance	0	2	0	0	0	0
TOTAL	206	213	88	102	106	71

Time Frame for Handling of Appeals

31. An appeal not involving a medical assessment is normally heard within one month from the date of receipt of the appeal by the Board. All appellants will be notified in writing of the decision of the Board within three weeks after the hearing or receipt of the decision of the Medical Assessment Board. All the appeals decided by the Board in the year were completed within the specified time frame.

Post-appeal Follow-up

32. As a standing practice, in addition to giving a written notification of its decision to the appellant, the Board will notify the relevant office and the Headquarters of the Social Welfare Department of its decision in writing after each appeal is completed. To ensure that appropriate follow-up action is taken by the Department, the Board will monitor the progress of appeals where the original decision of the Department has been varied.

Publicity

33. The appeal system is publicised through the displaying of posters at the reception area of each of the 41 social security field units and the Traffic Accident Victims Assistance Section. Members of the public can access information about the appeal system and the work of the Board from the leaflets available at these offices as well as the Headquarters of the Social Welfare Department and the Office of the Board. They can also find detailed information about the Board and download the application form for making an appeal from the homepage of the Social Welfare Department (<http://www.swd.gov.hk>).

34. It is a standard practice of the Social Welfare Department that whenever a person is notified in writing of the result of his application for social security benefits, he will at the same time be informed of his right to lodge an appeal with the Board if he is dissatisfied with the Department's decision.

IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

35. On behalf of the Board, I wish to express my heartfelt appreciation to all the members of the Board for their contribution and commitment in handling the social security appeals. I would also like to extend my sincere gratitude to the Director of Social Welfare and staff of the Social Welfare Department, the Chief Executive and staff of the Hospital Authority and all other parties concerned for their unfailing support to the Board. Special thanks are also extended to the members of the Medical Assessment Board for social security appeals for their valuable time and efforts in processing the appeal cases during the year under review.

Mr CHAN Chi-wing
Chairman

Functions of the Board and Appeal Procedures

Scope of Work

The Board deals with appeals under the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance, Social Security Allowance and Traffic Accident Victims Assistance Schemes.

2. The following categories of persons have the right of appeal -
 - (a) an applicant for or a recipient of a social security benefit under any one of the above-mentioned schemes (who may delegate his next-of-kin through the power of attorney to lodge the appeal on his behalf);
 - (b) an appointee acting on behalf of an applicant or a recipient who is aged below 18 or who has been medically certified to be unfit to make a statement on his own;
 - (c) the executor or the administrator, as proven by the production of "probate" or "letters of administration" granted respectively by the Court as evidence that he is a lawfully appointed personal representative of a deceased applicant or recipient; and
 - (d) the Official Administrator (the Registrar of the Court) administering the estate of a deceased applicant or recipient in a summary manner.

3. An appellant may appeal against a decision of the Director of Social Welfare in respect of any of the following matters -
 - (a) the refusal of any payment;
 - (b) the amount of payment offered;
 - (c) the date from which payment was offered; and
 - (d) the issuing of payment to a person other than the applicant.

Appeal Procedures

4. To lodge an appeal, the appellant should complete an appeal form (in either English or Chinese) and forward it to one of the following offices : the Office of the Board, the Headquarters of the Social Welfare Department, the Social Security Field Unit concerned, or the Traffic Accident Victims Assistance Section. Appeal forms are obtainable at any of these offices. The form can also be downloaded from the Social Welfare Department homepage (<http://www.swd.gov.hk>).

5. An appeal by an applicant, a recipient (or his next-of-kin appointed through the power of attorney) or an appointee must be lodged within four weeks immediately following the date of notification of the decision from the Director of Social Welfare. An appeal by the personal representative of a deceased applicant or recipient must be lodged within four weeks from the date of a grant of "probate" or "letters of administration" by the Court. In the case of summary administration by the Official Administrator, an appeal must be lodged within four weeks from the date of the getting in of the estate. The Chairman of the Board may allow late appeals if he considers that there were acceptable reasons for the delay.

6. If the appellant wishes to withdraw his appeal, he should complete and sign a withdrawal form to be obtainable from the offices mentioned in paragraph 4 above.

Departmental Reviews

7. When an appeal is received, the Secretary to the Board will examine the case. If it appears to him that there are sufficient grounds for a departmental review before the case is submitted to the Board, he will ask the supervisor of the Social Security Field Unit concerned or the Traffic Accident Victims Assistance Section to review the case. If the supervisor decides to vary the decision, the appellant will be notified in writing of the new decision as well as his right to appeal against it. If the appellant is satisfied with the new decision, he may withdraw the appeal. If he remains dissatisfied, he may appeal against the new decision. If he chooses not to appeal again, the case will not be referred to the Board, which will, nevertheless, be informed of what has occurred.

Processing of appeals

Appeals not involving the result of a medical assessment

8. The Board will normally hear the case within one month from the date of receipt of appeal.
9. Both the appellant and the Director of Social Welfare are given the opportunity to present their case in writing prior to the hearing.
10. At the hearing, the appellant may choose to put forward his case personally and, subject to the appellant's request in writing and the consent of the Board, a friend or relative may also speak on his behalf. The Director of Social Welfare may also be represented at the hearing. No other persons will be allowed to be present at the hearing, and there will be no legal representation.
11. Hearings are informal and conducted in a language convenient to the appellant.

Appeals involving the result of a medical assessment

12. The Board will arrange with the Hospital Authority for the applicant or recipient to undergo a medical assessment to be processed by the Medical Assessment Board for social security appeals.

Decisions of the Board

13. The Board will either confirm the decision appealed against or vary that decision provided that such a decision conforms to approved social security policy.
14. Except for appeals which require the decision of a Medical Assessment Board, the Board will reach a decision on an appeal on the basis of the facts presented to the Board. Its decision on a particular case will not constitute a precedent either for the Director of Social Welfare or for other cases coming before the Board.
15. In respect of appeals which require the decision of a Medical Assessment Board, the Board will give its decision on the basis of the decision of the Medical Assessment Board for social security appeals.
16. The decision of the Board is final and the appellant has no further right of appeal. The Board, however, has the right to review its own decision when necessary.

Notification of Decisions

17. In respect of appeals which do not require the decision of a Medical Assessment Board, the appellant and the Director of Social Welfare will be notified in writing of the decision of the Board normally within three weeks after the hearing. The Chairman of the Board may give reasons for the Board's decision if he so wishes, but is not obliged to do so.

18. In respect of appeals which require the decision of a Medical Assessment Board, the appellant and the Director of Social Welfare will be notified in writing of the decision of the Board normally within three weeks after the receipt of the decision of the Medical Assessment Board for social security appeals.

Travelling Expenses for Appellants

19. Appellants may claim reimbursement of travelling expenses incurred in lodging appeals at the Board and in attending Board hearings at the Office of the Board. The amount of fares they can claim is limited to that charged by the cheapest mode of transport. However, claims in respect of a more expensive form of transport may be allowed for disabled appellants or appellants with mobility difficulties.

Analysis of Complaints Received

Nature of Complaints	Number of Complaints				Percentage
	Comprehensive Social Security Assistance	Social Security Allowance	Traffic Accident Victims Assistance	Total	
Refusal of any payment	13	12	0	25	41%
Amount of payment offered	14	8	0	22	36%
Date from which payment was offered	0	1	0	1	2%
Issue of payment to a person other than the applicant	0	0	0	0	0%
Delay of payment	0	0	0	0	0%
Others	7	6	0	13	21%
Total	34	27	0	61	100%

Analysis of Appeals Received

Nature of Appeals	Number of Appeals							
	Comprehensive Social Security Assistance		Social Security Allowance		Traffic Accident Victims Assistance		Total (Percentage)	
	Medical Decision	Others	Medical Decision	Others	Medical Decision	Others	Medical Decision	Others
Refusal of any payment	0	1	195	0	0	0	195	1
Amount of payment offered	40	4	16	1	1	0	57	5
Date from which payment was offered	0	0	0	5	0	0	0	5
Issue of payment to a person other than the applicant	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sub-total	40	5	211	6	1	0	252 (96%)	11 (4%)
TOTAL	45		217		1		263 (100%)	

APPENDIX 4

**Breakdown of Comprehensive Social Security Assistance
Appeals Received by Nature of Case**

Nature of Case		No. of Appeals		Percentage
Old Age		13		29%
Permanent Disabilities	Blind	0	0	0%
	Deaf	0		
	Physically Disabled	0		
	Mentally Ill/Mentally Retarded	0		
Temporary Disabilities/Ill Health		22		49%
Single Parent Family		0		0%
Economic Circumstances	Low Earnings	0	10	22%
	Unemployment	10		
Others		0		0%
TOTAL		45		100%

**Breakdown of Social Security Allowance
Appeals Received by Nature of Case or Disability Claimed**

Nature of Case		No. of Appeals			Percentage
		Higher Disability Allowance	Normal Disability Allowance	Total	
I.	Disability Allowance				
	A. Disabling physical condition or blindness				
	(i) loss of functions of two limbs	1	0		
	(ii) loss of functions of both hands, or all fingers and both thumbs	0	0		
	(iii) loss of functions of both feet	0	0		
	(iv) total loss of sight	0	2		
	(v) total paralysis (quadriplegia)	0	0	173	80%
	(vi) paraplegia	0	0		
	(vii) illness, injury or deformity resulting in being bedridden	0	0		
	(viii) any other conditions resulting in total disablement	13	157		
	B. Disabling mental condition (which produces a degree of disability broadly equivalent to that in Category A above)				
	(i) organic brain syndrome	0	0		
	(ii) mental retardation	0	0	25	11%
	(iii) psychosis	0	1		
	(iv) neurosis	0	1		
	(v) personality disorder	0	0		
	(vi) any other conditions resulting in total mental disablement	2	21		
	C. Profoundly deaf	0	13	13	6%
	D. Others	0	0	0	0%
	Sub-total	16	195	211	97%
II.	Old Age Allowance/Old Age Living Allowance			6	3%
	TOTAL			217	100%

